




Factors affecting environmental performance in The Ectourism Industry in Bali Indonesia

I Made Darsana¹, Francisca Titing Koerniawaty²

^{1,2}Prodi Magister Terapan Perencanaan Dan Pengembangan Pariwisata, Denpasar Institute of Tourism and International Business, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
<p><i>Article history:</i></p> <p>Received Jan 20, 2023 Revised Feb 12, 2023 Accepted Feb 24, 2023</p>	<p>Environmental changes and global warming are also being felt in the tourism industry. The success of the tourism industry is highly dependent on the demand for tourism. International tourism is recognized as very vulnerable to crises or disasters. The main issues in this research are whether Green HRM is a predictor of environmental performance and whether the citizenship behavior of environmental organizations of employees acts as a mediator in the ecotourism industry in Bali, Indonesia. The purpose of this research is to find out the factors that affect environmental performance in the ecotourism industry in Bali, Indonesia. This type of research uses a quantitative approach with a cross sectional and non-experimental approach. The research design is also descriptive and explanatory in nature because it does not only focus on the current condition of green HRM but also explains the relationship between variables, namely Organizational Citizenship Behavior (Z) GHRM (X). The results of the study show that Green HRM is able to increase the OCB of employees in the Ecotourism Industry in Bali Indonesia. Green HRM has a positive and insignificant effect on Environmental Performance and Employee OCB has a positive and significant effect on Environmental Performance. Employee OCB is able to mediate the effect of Green HRM positively and significantly on environmental performance and the formation of environmental performance is more dominantly influenced by employee OCB.</p>
<p><i>Keywords:</i></p> <p>Ecotourism Environmental Change Green HRM Organization</p>	<p><i>This is an open access article under the CC BY- NC license.</i></p> 

Corresponding Author:

I Made Darsana
Prodi Magister Terapan Perencanaan Dan Pengembangan Pariwisata,
Denpasar Institute of Tourism and International Business,
Jl. Kecak No. 12, Tonja, Kec. North Denpasar, Denpasar City, Bali 80239, Indonesia.
Email: made.darsana@ipb-intl.ac.id

INTRODUCTION

Higher levels of competition, uncertain climate and global warming are major issues in the tourism industry today (Mishra, 2017; Hussain et al., 2019). Environmental changes and global warming are also being felt in the tourism industry. The success of the tourism industry depends heavily on tourism demand. International tourism is recognized as very vulnerable to crises or disasters (Ritchie and Jiang, 2019). Job seekers pay high attention to organizations that are environmentally conscious (Gully, Phillips, Castellano, Han, & Kim, 2013), which means that organizations that try to attract and recruit positions for employees who have good competence and that emphasize environmental sustainability. Studies conducted by Shafique UR (2020), explain that good GHRM can improve an organization's environmental performance. However, GHRM itself has developed over the last

thirty years and has always been a concern for job seekers because companies that implement GHRM will guarantee employees to be able to work well and comfortably (Renwick et al., 2016).

Furthermore, Renwick et al., (2016) explained that the recruitment and selection processes in organizations that emphasize environmental sustainability reflect an increased influence of GHRM. In addition, because the need for environmental protection is growing. GHRM which is concerned with the environment will also affect training, management, and leadership development in organizations (Renwick et al., 2016). A recent study has shown that utilizing GHRM can help achieve environmental sustainability (Paille et al., 2020). The results of other studies explain that employee Organizational Citizenship Behavior (OCB) influences environmental performance). Although some research results indicate that GHRM may not be related to economic sustainability (Yusoff et al., 2019). The relationship between GHRM and the performance of the environment needs to be reviewed again by including the OCB variable as a mediating variable (Nosheen A, 2020). Based on the description as described on the background of the problem and based on theoretical and empirical thinking, it can be proposed that the main issues in this study are whether Green HRM is a predictor of environmental performance and whether environmental organizational citizenship behavior of employees plays a role as a mediator in the ecotourism industry in Bali, Indonesia.

RESEARCH METHOD

The research design is also descriptive and explanatory in nature because it does not only focus on the current state of green HRM, but also explains the relationship between variables namely Organizational Citizenship Behavior (Z) GHRM (X) Organizational Environmental Performance (Y).

This study was reviewed based on findings from previous studies. This study tries to present how the mediating variable plays a role in the relationship between the independent and dependent variables. The data is collected through a questionnaire. The questionnaire is used considering the focus of this research is the stakeholder's perspective on the condition of the research object. Questionnaires were distributed to respondents, namely tourists who visited the Tirta Empul-Tampaksiring tourist attraction. This study used purposive sampling. The distribution of the questionnaire was carried out accidental, namely taking respondents who happened to be available or available somewhere according to the research context. The current research population is all employees at ecotourism destinations in Gianyar-Bali Regency with a total of 163 employees. A total of 163 questionnaires were distributed among ecotourism destination employees and 130 questionnaires were returned. The Green HRM measure was adapted. In this measure, green recruitment & selection is measured by 5 items; Green Training & Development is measured by 5 items; Green performance and ratings are measured by 5 items; Green rewards are measured by 3 items; and employee empowerment and participation is measured by 5 items. OCB-E is measured by 10 items and adapted from Boiral and Paille (2012).

Organizational environmental performance is measured by 5 items and adapted. The reliability was tested using Cronbach Alpha and composite reliability; meanwhile, validity was determined by testing convergent validity and different validity through confirmatory factor analysis (CFA). Details the data analysis used in this research is Partial Least Square (PLS) analysis with a calculation process assisted by the SmartPLS software application program. Analysis with PLS was used because the model used in this study was quite complicated and the respondents who were part of this study were less than 100 respondents/tourists who visited the Tirta Empul Tampaksiring Temple to provide services to tourists.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Based on the results of data collection on 130 respondents, then data analysis was carried out including a description of the characteristics of the respondents, a description of the score of the

respondents' answers and an analysis of the influence using PLS software. Analysis of the PLS output includes evaluating the Outer model and evaluating the inner model.

Characteristics of Respondents

This study also briefly describes the characteristics of the respondents in the study area, which include: (1) gender; (2) education; and (3) age. Based on the tabulation of data collection results with a questionnaire, where the characteristics of the respondents based on gender are presented in Table 1 below:

Table 1. Characteristics of Respondents Based on Gender

No	Gender	frequency	
		(People)	(%)
1.	Male	78	60.0
2.	Female	52	40.0
amount		130	100.00

In Table 1 it can be seen that the respondents were male, namely 78 people or 60.0 percent, while female sex 52 people or 40.0 percent. That is the gender of the respondents is dominated by men. This means that employees who carry out activities in the tourist destination of Gianyar are dominated by men.

Based on the tabulation of data collection results with a questionnaire, as related to the characteristics of the respondent's educational level are presented in Table 2 below:

Table 2. Characteristics of Respondents Based on Education Level

No	Level Education	Frequency	
		(person)	(%)
1.	SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL	24	18.5
2.	Diploma	20	15.4
3.	S1	86	66,1
Amount		105	100.00

Table 2 clearly shows that most of the respondents' education level is Bachelor (S1), namely 86 people or 66.1 percent. Followed by high school level of education, namely a number of 24 people or 18.5 percent. Furthermore, the level of Diploma education is 20 people or 15.4 percent. Thus it can be concluded that the educational level of employees who work in Gianyar tourist destinations mostly have undergraduate education.

Furthermore, based on the tabulation of data collection results with a questionnaire, as related to the age characteristics of the respondents shown in Table 3 below:

Table 3. Characteristics of Respondents by Age

No	Age (year)	Frequency	
		(person)	(%)
1.	18-26	27	20,8
2.	27 - 44	64	49,2
3.	45 - 64	39	30.0
Amount		105	100.00

In Table 3 the figure shows that most of the respondents are aged between 27 and 44 years, namely 64 years (49.2%). In the second place are respondents aged 45 to 64 years or 39 (30.0%). In third place respondents were aged 18 to 26, namely 27 people (20.8%). Therefore, it can be said that most of the workers working in the Gianyar tourist center are elderly people. To find out respondents' perceptions of each research variable, respondents' perceptions of green HRM latent variables, respondents' perceptions of OCB Employee variables and perceptions of "the environment around differences in performance".

Respondents' Perceptions of GREEN HRM Latent Variables

To find out how respondents felt the potential for green HRM changes in the study environment, we collected data by giving several statements to respondents. Respondents' responses are displayed in a frequency table, like the table below.

Table 4. Respondents' Perceptions of Green HRM Variables

Dimensions	Indicator	Answer Frequency					Indicator Revision	Dimensional Average	Variable Average
		1	2	3	4	5			
<i>Green Recruitment and Selection</i>	x1.1.1	0	0	3	72	55	4,40	4,47	
	x1.1.2	0	0	0	67	63	4.48		
	x1.1.3	0	0	0	63	67	4.52		
	x1.1.4	0	0	0	65	65	4.50		
<i>Green Training and Development</i>	x1.2.1	0	0	2	68	60	4.45	4,42	
	x1.2.2	0	0	5	60	65	4.46		
	x1.2.3	0	0	5	65	60	4,42		
	x1.2.4	0	0	2	79	49	4.36		
<i>Green Compensation</i>	x1.3.1	0	1	2	68	59	4,42	4,36	4,40
	x1.3.2	0	1	8	74	47	4,28		
	x1.3.3	0	1	2	74	53	4.38		
	x1.3.4	0	1	5	72	52	4.35		
<i>Green Performance Appraisal</i>	x1.4.1	0	1	6	63	60	4,40	4,34	
	x1.4.2	0	1	13	57	59	4,34		
	x1.4.3	0	1	0	65	64	4.48		
	x1.4.4	0	1	1	75	53	4.38		
	x1.4.5	4	1	23	67	35	3.98		
	x1.4.6	0	1	1	78	50	4.46		

The data in Table 4 shows respondents' perceptions of each dimension and the latent variable Green HRM on average tends to be high with an average score above 4.00 on a scale of 5. Especially for the Green HRM variable it has an average score of 4.40. This means that Green HRM in realizing OCB Employee and employee performance gets high appreciation. The highest average score among the four Green HRM dimensions is on the green recruitment and selection dimension with an average score of 4.47 on a scale of five. Respondents perceive that green recruitment and selection is very good. Furthermore, the average scores of the dimensions of green training and development, green compensation, and green performance appraisal are 4.42, 4.36, and 4.34 respectively. The green recruitment and selection dimension is seen as the most important dimension for Green HRM compared to the other three dimensions.

Respondents' Perceptions of Employee Performance Latent Variables

In order to find out how the respondents perceive the *employee performance latent variable* at the research location, data is collected by giving a number of statements to the respondents. Respondents' answers are then presented in a perceptual frequency table like the following table.

Table 5. Respondents' Perceptions of Employee Performance Variables

Dimensions	Indicator	Answer Frequency					Indicator Revision	Dimensional Average	Variable Average
		1	2	3	4	5			
<i>Regulatory Demands</i>	y2.1.1	0	0	1	66	63	4.48	4,33	
	y2.1.2	0	0	3	75	52	4.38		
	y2.1.3	0	0	15	80	35	4,15		
<i>Cost Factor</i>	y2.2.1	0	0	3	79	48	4.35	4.36	4,40
	y2.2.2	0	0	5	72	53	4.37		
<i>Stakeholder Forces</i>	y2.3.1	0	0	1	68	61	4.46	4.48	
	y2.3.2	0	0	1	64	65	4.49		
	y2.4.1	0	0	1	66	63	4.48		

Competitive Requirements	y2.4.2	0	0	7	69	54	4.36
--------------------------	--------	---	---	---	----	----	------

Data in Table 6 shows that respondents' perceptions of each dimension and the latent variable Employee Performance tend to be high on average with an average score above 4.00 on a scale of 5. Especially for the Employee Performance variable, it has an average score of 4.40. This means that Employee Performance gets high appreciation. The highest average score among the four dimensions of Employee Performance is in the Stakeholder Forces dimension with an average score of 4.48 on a scale of five. Respondents perceive Stakeholder Forces very well. Furthermore, the average score of the Regulatory Demand, Competitive Requirements, and Cost Factor dimensions is 4.43, 4.43, and 4.36 respectively. The Stakeholder Forces dimension is seen as the most important dimension for Employee Performance compared to the other three dimensions.

Outer Model Evaluation (Measurement Model).

External standardized tests were used for each measurement of each of the studied variables. Evaluation of the external model includes two tests, namely the validity test and reliability test. The tests used include (1) factor loading test, (2) Fornell-Larcker test, and (3) cross-sectional test. Reliability assessment according to Cooper and Schindler (2006) can be assessed by looking at the value of Cronbach's Alpha, rho_A, Composite Reliability and Average Variance Extracted (AVE).

Validity test

Construct validity refers to the degree of agreement of the measure used with the theory used to define the construct. One way to measure effectiveness is to measure the strength of the relationship between the environment and its components. Construct validity is achieved when there is a strong relationship between the construct and the problem and a weak relationship with other variables.

In this study there are 3 variables including the Green HRM variable (X1) with 4 dimensions namely Green Recruitment and Selection (X1.1), Green Training and Development (X1.2), Green Compensation (X1.3), and Green Performance Appreciation (X1.4). OCB Employee variable (Y1) with 5 dimensions namely Litruism (Y1.1), Courtesy (Y1.2), Sportsmanship (Y1.3), Civic Vertua (Y1.4), and Concientiousness (Y1.5). Environmental Performance variable (Y2) with 4 dimensions, namely Regulatory Demand (Y2.1), Cost Factor (Y2.2), Stakeholder Forces (Y2.3), and Competitive Requirements (Y2.4) is a second order construct.

Table 6. Specific Indirect Effects With OCB Employee As Mediation Variable
Original Sample, T-Values, P-Values

	Original Sample (O)	T Statistics (O/STDEV)	P Values
X1 -> Y1 -> Y2	0.486	2,837	0.002

Based on the data in Table 7, it is possible to test the formulation of hypothesis 4 : **Green HRM Has a Positive and Significant Influence on Environmental Performance with OCB Employee Work as a Mediating Variable**

The hypothesis that states a positive effect is denoted by $\beta_i > 0$, thus a one-sided test will be carried out, namely the right side. H_a is accepted or H_0 is rejected if $t_{count} > critical t$ and $P < \alpha$. Referring to the t-table of Hubert M Blalock (1985: 603) at the error rate (α) = 5% for a one-tailed test, the coefficient t_{table} or $critical t = 1.658$ is obtained.

Data in Table 7 for the effect of Green HRM on Environmental Performance through OCB Employee ($X_1 \rightarrow Y_1 \rightarrow Y_2$) shows *path coefficients* (β) = 0.486, $T_{statistics} = 2.837$ and $P_{value} = 0.002$. The magnitude of $T_{statistics} = 2.837 > critical t = 1.658$ and $P_{value} = 0.002 < \alpha = 0.050$ thus statistically at $\alpha = 5\%$, H_0 is rejected or H_a is accepted. That is, the hypothesis states that Green HRM has a positive and significant effect on Environmental Performance with OCB Employee work as a mediating variable is proven true. The role of OCB Employee as a mediation has a significant positive effect on the

influence of Green HRM on Environmental Performance . In other words, OCB Employee is able to mediate the indirect effect of Green HRM on Environmental Performance.

Effect size testing

Gravetter and Wallnau (2004), when researchers report a statistically significant effect, they need to also report the *effect size*. To see the effect of each exogenous latent construct on its endogenous variables, an *effect size evaluation* (f^2) can be used. *Effect size* is defined as the strength of the relationship or influence between the independent variables and the dependent variable. Table 8 below shows the *effect size* coefficient of each relationship of exogenous variables to endogenous variables. The *effect size* based on three criteria, namely 0.02 - 0.14 (small), 0.15 - 0.35 (medium), and > 0.35 (large).

Table 7. Coefficient effect size (f-square)

Relations Between Constructs	f Square	Category Effect
Green HRM → OCB Employee ($X_1 \rightarrow Y_1$)	4,595	Big
Green HRM → Environmental Performance ($X_1 \rightarrow Y_2$)	0.539	Big
OCB Employee → Environmental Performance ($Y_1 \rightarrow Y_2$)	0.755	Big

Table 8 shows the largest *effect size* coefficient on OCB Employee is by the big Green HRM (4,595). Against the Environment Performance, it looks *the largest effect size* coefficient is owned by the *OCB Employee* variable (0.755), then followed by the Green HRM variable of 0.539. Thus it can be stated that Environment Performance dominantly influenced by OCB Employee. Based on the *effect size* dominant on Environmental Performance it can be stated that the presence of OCB Employees is very meaningful in the formation of Environmental Performance, while Green HRM is a supporter in the formation of OCB Employees.

CONCLUSION

The results of this study indicate that Green HRM is able to increase employee OCB in the Ecotourism Industry in Bali Indonesia. Furthermore, it can also be explained that Green HRM has a positive and not significant effect on Environment Performance and OCB Employee has a positive and significant effect on Environment Performance. Furthermore, the results of this study also explain that OCB employees are able to mediate positively and significantly influence Green HRM on environmental performance and the formation of environmental performance is more dominantly influenced by OCB employees. This research model can be used as a reference in creating an increase in OCB employees and an increase in environmental performance in the ecotourism industry in Gianyar Bali. In an effort to improve environmental performance, more improvements or guidance should be made to create an OCB employee.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to God Almighty for His great way in guiding me to finish this Article and for His unending love, guidance, and blessings while I was studying. Sincere thanks to my parents for their love, effort, prayer, and support when I was studying and to my mentors for their guidance, inspiration, patience, and encouragement. I also thank my brothers and sisters for their love, prayers, and support. Last but not least, I thank my friends from the Denpasar Institute of Tourism and International Business. With the publication of this article, I am very grateful to those who helped in publishing it so that it was successfully published.

References

- Cranford, SW (2020). Seven Seconds or Less: Buzzworthy Titles in the Era of MOFs and Tinder. Mishra, P. (2017) 'Framework for Sustainable Organizational Development in an Emerging Economy', *International Journal of Organizational Analysis*, 25, No 5.
- Hussain, S., Chandio, A., Alaboodi, AS, Ahmed, I. (2019) 'Role of Automotive Industry in Global Warming', *Pakistan Journal of Scientific & Industrial Research*, 62(3), pp. 197–201.
- Ritchie, BW and Jiang, Y. (2019) 'A review of research on tourism risk, crisis and disaster management: Launching the annals of tourism research curated collection on tourism risk, crisis and disaster management', *Annals of Tourism Research*. Elsevier, 79(November), p. 102812. doi: 10.1016/j.annals.2019.102812.
- Gully, SM, Phillips, JM, Castellano, WG, Han, K., & Kim, A. (2013). A mediated moderation model of recruiting socially and environmentally responsible job applicants. *Personnel Psychology*, 66 (4), 935-973.
- Shafique Ur Rehman, Sascha Kraus, Syed Asim Shah, Dmitry Khanin, and Raj V. Mahto (2020). Analyzing the relationship between green innovation and environmental performance in large manufacturing firms. , *Technological Forecasting & Social Change*, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2020.120481>
- Pascal Paillé, Yang Chen, Olivier Boiral & Jiafei Jin . 2014. The Impact of Human Resource Management on Environmental Performance: An Employee-Level Study. *Journal of Business Ethics* volumes 121 , pages451–466 (2014)
- Nosheen Anwar, Nik Hasnaa Nik Mahmood, Mohd Yusoff Yusliza , T. Ramayah, Juhari Noor Faezah and Waqas Khalid.2020. Green Human Resource Management for organizational citizenship behavior towards the environment and environmental performance on a university campus. 0959-6526/© 2020 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.
- Yusoff, YM, Omar, MK, Zaman, MDK, & Samad, S. (2019). Do all elements of green intellectual capital contribute toward business sustainability? Evidence from the Malaysian context using the Partial Least Squares method. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 234, 626-637.
- Paillé, P., Valéau, P., & Renwick, DW (2020). Leveraging green human resource practices to achieve environmental sustainability. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 260, 121137.
- Renwick, DWS, Jabbour, CJC, Muller-Camen, M., Redman, T., &Wilkinson, A. (2016). Contemporary developments in Green (environmental) HRM scholarship. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 27(2), 114–128. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09585192.2015.1105844>
- Alt, E., & Spitzack, H. (2016). Improving environmental performance through unit-level organizational citizenship behaviors for the environment: A capability perspective. *Journal of environmental management*, 182, 48-58.
- Alnajdawi, S., Emeagwali, OL, & Elrehail, H. (2017). The interplay among green human resource practices, organizational citizenship behavior for the environment and sustainable corporate performance: evidence from Jordan. *Journal of Environmental Accounting and Management*, 5 (3), 171-184.
- Pinzone, M., Guerci, M., Lettieri, E., Redman, T., 2016. Progressing in the change journey towards sustainability in healthcare: the role of 'Green' HRM. *J. Clean. Prod.* 122, 201e211.
- Podsakoff, PM, Ahearne, M., MacKenzie, SB, 1997. Organizational citizenship behavior and the quantity and quality of workgroup performance. *J. Appl. Psychol.* 82, 262e270. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.82.2.262>.
- Boiral, O., 2009. Greening the corporation through organizational citizenship behaviors.nJ. *buses. Ethics* 87, 221e236. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10551-008-9881-2>
- Daily, BF, Bishop, JW, Govindarajulu, N., 2009. A conceptual model for organizational citizenship behavior directed toward the environment. *buses. Soc.* 48, 243e256. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/0007650308315439>
- MacKenzie, SB, Podsakoff, PM, Fetter, R., 1991. Organizational citizenship behavior and objective productivity as determinants of managerial evaluations of salespersons' performance. *Organ. Behav. Hum. Decis. Process.* 50, 123e150. [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0749-5978\(91\)90037-T](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/0749-5978(91)90037-T)
- Yu, W., Chavez, R., Feng, M., Wong, CY, Fynes, B., 2020. Green human resource management and environmental cooperation: an ability-motivation opportunity and contingency perspective. *int. J. Prod. Econ.* 219, 224e235.
- Cheema, S., Javed, F., 2017. The effects of corporate social responsibility toward green human resource management: the mediating role of a sustainable environment. *Cogent Bus. Manag.* 4, 1e10.
- MacKenzie, SB, Podsakoff, PM, Fetter, R., 1993. The impact of organizational citizenship behavior on evaluation

- of salesperson performance. *J. Mark.* 57, 70e80. <http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/1252058> .
- Pinzone, M., Guerci, M., Lettieri, E., Redman, T., 2016. Progressing in the change journey towards sustainability in healthcare: the role of 'Green' HRM. *J. Clean. Prod.* 122, 201e211.
- Pham, NT, Tu_ckov_a, Z., Jabbour, CJC, 2019. Greening the hospitality industry: how do green human resource management practices influence organizational citizenship behavior in hotels? A mixed-methods study. *Tourism Manag.* 72, 386e399 *Matter* , 3 (4), 965-967 .
- Cronje, JC (2020). Designing Questions for Research Design and Design Research in e- Learning . *Electronic Journal of E-Learning* , 18 (1), pp13-24 .
- Fryer, LK, & Dinsmore, DL (2020). The Promise and Pitfalls of Self-report: Development, research design and analysis of issues, and multiple methods. *Frontline Learning Research* , 8 (3), 1-9 .
- Grieshaber, S. (2020). Equity and research design. In *Doing early childhood research* (pp. 177-191). Routledge .
- Saragih, M., & Novimariono, N. (2020). An Experimental Study of the Effectiveness PEOW MODEL Through Applying Quartet Cards in Teaching English Writing. *Indonesian Journal of Education, Social Sciences and Research (IJESSR)* , 1 (1), 32-40 .
- Shu, K., Mahudeswaran, D., Wang, S., Lee, D., & Liu, H. (2020). Fakenewsnet: A data repository with news content, social context, and spatiotemporal information for studying fake news on social media. *Big Data* , 8 (3), 171-188 .
- Stewart, E. (2021). Detecting Fake News: Two Problems for Content Moderation. *Philosophy & Technology* , 1-18 .
- van der Giesen, C., Cucurachi, S., Guinée, J., Kramer, GJ, & Tukker, A. (2020). A critical view on the current application of LCA for new technologies and recommendations for improved practice. *Journal of Cleaner Production* , 259 , 120904 .